An especially engaging chapter explores attempts by Mormons to map the terrain described in the Book of Mormon. The book describes lands in the north and south, regions of abundant water, specific rivers, narrow necks of land, and deserts. The book’s descriptions of its geographical setting and general distances between locations are internally consistent but sufficiently vague to inspire competing speculative theories among believers regarding actual American locations that might be described in the book. Francaviglia discusses a dozen or so attempts to map Book of Mormon geography onto real-world locations.

Francaviglia analyzes Mormon uses of maps to facilitate proselytizing and missionary work and to chart the church’s international growth. He shows that these managerial maps produced by administrators at church headquarters or in regional mission offices carve up the landscape using topography, cultural constructions, and even arbitrary lines that sometimes clash with the lived experience and spatial perceptions of local members. Thus mapping reflects the bureaucratic centralization and ‘organizational rigidity’ (p. 221) characteristic of Mormonism.

The book is peppered with interesting digressions. Some are carefully developed such as the parallels the author draws between Islam and Mormonism. Others seem more idiosyncratic or loosely connected such as the land tenure history of a tract in Santa Clara County, California purchased by a member of the Mormon Battalion. Even in the tangents and digressions, Francaviglia’s insatiable curiosity, enthusiasm for his topic, and perception of wide-ranging connections invigorate the volume.

Brian Q. Cannon
Brigham Young University, USA

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhg.2016.05.014


Too often, the frontier history of the American West is popularized as a two-dimensional tale of cowboys versus Indians, with successive waves of explorers, trappers, soldiers, and settlers pushing westward, overcoming obstacles of (Native) man and nature. While many of these same elements remain in view in Epiphany in the Wilderness, historian Karen Jones calls forth a refreshingly diverse cast of characters, processes, and perspectives in this ambitious book.

In the introduction, Jones highlights her intentions to present a richer version of western US history: ‘Disentangling the complex relationships between the human actors and the wild things they pursued sits at the heart’ of the book (p. 5). This rings true, though not every tangled thread of U.S. western development can be picked fully loose, and the actual events of this period are likely just too messy to fit honestly into a clean chronology.

At one level, Epiphany in the Wilderness centers upon the ‘colorful procession of sport hunters’ (p. 8) that inundated the nineteenth century American West. Jones identifies this group of gun-toting visitors as the main interest of her book, and while it’s true that Epiphany attends to sport hunters in vivid detail, this framing sells the book a bit short. It’s necessarily about much more than sport hunters, and keeping to this orbit at times seems to limit the book’s reach. While sport hunters played a critical role in the political ecology of the nineteenth-century American West, and Jones does well to elevate these characters, their motives, and their lasting impacts on frontier ecology and culture, the systematic destruction of the American bison as a genocidal program to eradicate indigenous culture and resistance only fleetingly comes into view.

Jones readily acknowledges that the history of the American West is replete with complexity, contestation, and diverse characters. To try to capture this, Jones structures the book around three main sections. The first, Actors and Agents, includes chapters on the masculinity of the hunt and frontier-era Hunter Heroes; the martial culture of guns and their evolving technologies; and the proto-feminism of Hunter Heroines in the early West. The second section turns upon ideas of Story, Image, and Trophy, with chapters dedicated to nineteenth-century art and photography, stage(d) productions of the West, and animal taxidermy. The relatively short final section moves to Saving the Frontier, and the emergence of a US conservation movement and rejection — at least in part — of the frontier hunting ethos.

While the book’s main sections provide a helpful degree of internal coherence, taken chapter by chapter Epiphany in the Wilderness seems to reproduce some of the complexity Jones pledges to disentangle. To her credit, Jones avoids the temptation to try to fit American frontier history into a series of distinct and progressive eras. Without this, however, it’s a bit hard to find cohesion in the narrative arc. The American West was (and in many ways remains), for example, highly masculinized, but also can be seen as a place where women created political and personal identities that defied convention. The relationship between humans and wildlife is similarly difficult to cast in singular form — or as a steady progression — as women found in the landscape of western US. For example, hunting or conservation sentiment. It was each of these, and more.

Taken individually, the chapters hold together well. Individual or clusters of chapters would work nicely in a course reader or to examine a theme such as the role of women or that of performance in the early American West. Chapter six’s examination of taxidermy stands out for its examination of preserved carcasses that spread across North America and Europe as animals were killed, then mounted and shipped as trophies. It’s difficult to find a broadly progressive message in the book as a whole, but this does come through in some of the individuals Jones profiles, and for whom the title’s promise seems to hold. William Hornaday, Bill Cody, and Aldo Leopold, for example, each seem to find their life-changing moment in the wild, though a bit late for the thousands of critters that died at their hands before this came to pass.

Jones consistently acknowledges that the American West never was exclusively a proving ground for masculine hunting heroes, the province of demure (or raconteur) women, or source of anti-hunting or conservation sentiment. It was each of these, and more. And yet, I can’t help but wish that Jones’s history linked more explicitly and more often to the many politics of nature, both past and present. Jones brings the political ecology of hunting women, for example, into view, noting that, ‘women found in the landscape of the hunt a place for the loosening of cultural norms... successful hunting endeavors undoubtedly fostered the idea of women as strong, resilient, and competent in realms typically seen as the preserve of men’ (p. 129). This is an enticing prospect — that the feminine (and feminist) performance of the hunt would springboard women toward emancipation, suffrage, and careers in politics or
business — and I would have loved to see Jones explore these possibilities in more depth. She later offers a hint of what this might look like, with the intriguing example of Martha Maxwell’s activist brand of truth-in-taxidermy (pp. 253—262). Instead of developing these ideas more fully, Jones largely dismisses the linkages between hunting and progressive feminist politics as being difficult to document and the disjointed efforts of ‘deviant figures’ (p. 129). That said, Jones’s characterizations of early western women, both well-known and obscure, are rich in detail and effectively disrupt any visions of a uniformly masculine American frontier.

David G. Havlick
University of Colorado - Colorado Springs, Colorado Springs, USA

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhg.2016.07.007


Peasants and Lords in the Medieval English Economy brings together papers given at the Eleventh Anglo-American Seminar on the Medieval Economy and Society in honour of Bruce Campbell, a pioneering historian of medieval agriculture. Through works like English Seigniorial Agriculture (2000), England on the Eve of the Black Death (2006), British Economic Growth (2015), and recent research on the medieval environment culminating in The Great Transition (2016), Campbell has significantly shaped the field of medieval economic history. As Langdon, Kowaleski, and Schofield highlight in the introduction, this collection of essays represents the broader interests of the authors rather than revisiting specific elements of Campbell’s work. Nonetheless, Campbell’s impact upon the study of the medieval economy runs throughout the volume, with significant focus upon agricultural productivity, levels of commercialisation, and the impact of the environment.

Split into four parts, the first focuses upon agricultural performance. Noting the potential for evasion and the difficulties of interpreting lay subsidy rolls, Philip Slavin refutes Postan’s pessimistic conclusions about peasant livestock in chapter 1 by producing a series of hypothetical (though well-informed) calculations of livestock numbers and stocking densities, showing the influence of geography, gender, and lordship on animal husbandry for Blackbourne Hundred in 1283. Through the manorial and household accounts of the Le Strange family, Jane Whittle explores the consumption patterns of harvest workers and minor lords in the early fourteenth century in chapter 2, finding that a family of five could be provided with the calories necessary for survival by a holding of 6.2 acres on Hunstanton manor, Norfolk. These two chapters show some of the difficulties historians face in making these calculations; Slavin uses 2000 kcal. per day as an average requirement, whereas Whittle uses 1500 kcal. per day. Using the extents for debt in chapter 3, which sometimes contain a survey of the entire farm and an itemised list of movables of the indebted, John Langdon concludes that grain productivity was broadly similar in the landlord and non-landlord sectors, but, after the Black Death, the non-landlord sector became more productive than its landlord counterpart. Similarly, in chapter 4 Christopher Dyer uses Worcester Priory’s ‘estimations of the corn’ to demonstrate differences in peasant agriculture between woodland and champion land and the ways in which demesne and peasant farming might move in tandem, in a sudden increase in the amount of pulses grown, or independently, as in the peasant preference for growing wheat.

The first chapter in the book’s second part on lords and villeins is an evaluation of the controversial historiography surrounding medieval villeinage provided by John Hatcher, whose own disagreements with Dyer have done so much to shape the field. Though there is now a renewed consensus that villeinage provided customary restraints upon lords, there are many questions remaining about the social and cultural history of villeinage. Challenging the orthodoxy of the seigniorial reaction in chapter 6, Mark Bailey convincingly argues that historians have latched onto a few examples of oppressive measures taken by lords against their serfville tenants after the Black Death and ignored the complete absence of such evidence on many estates, an argument developed more fully in his recent book, The Decline of Serfdom (2014). Through the works of John of Salisbury, Giles of Rome, and Christine de Pizan, Stephen Rigby explores medieval social ideology from images of the body politic to Aristotelian thought in chapter 7, demonstrating the various ways that medieval thinkers explained and justified the social inferiority experienced by the peasantry.

In the first chapter of the book’s third part on peasants, lords and markets, Phillipp Schofield argues that large numbers of freeholds on the estates of the abbey of Bury St Edmunds since at least the eleventh century may help to explain the peasant market in unfree land: rather than the ‘arbitrary imposition of a lordly policy’, regional differences in land markets can be explained by ‘lords’ responses to prevailing conditions’ (p. 220). In one of his final papers, the late Richard Britnell builds upon his previous work on the commercialisation of the medieval economy by demonstrating in chapter 9 the markets, networks, and labour needs involved in repairing and maintaining farm equipment and buildings before the Black Death: new and second-hand markets existed for large items like carts and ploughs, all the way down to spades and nails. In the first of two chapters tackling rural markets, Chris Briggs explores the motivations for founding and regulating village markets through a case study of Balsham, Cambridgeshire, demonstrating how the lord was intent upon enforcing a monopoly over the trade of local tenants, but questioning whether this was a simple case of rent-seeking or a broader concern over food shortages in the aftermath of the Great Famine. Similarly, in chapter 11 James Davis questions the implications of Masschele’s findings that some forty percent of village markets with charters were effectively non-functioning: what more did a village with a chartered market actually offer to peasant producers and consumers than villages without?

In the first chapter of the book’s fourth part on peasants, poverty, and the environment, Bennett sheds new light on the structural poverty of rural women in medieval England, which was both absolute and relative. Unlike their early modern counterparts, single women did not have the option of spinning commercially in thirteenth-century England, whilst women’s wage work was episodic and poorly paid. In chapter 13, Marilyn Livingstone builds upon Bruce Campbell’s considerable work on the medieval environment by drawing upon excuses in the Nonae taxation returns for large swathes of agricultural land out of cultivation (over 131,000 acres), showing the occurrences of floods, severe coastal storms, drought, and animal disease in 1339—41. Peasants were also willing and able to exploit the sea, as Maryanne Kowaleski demonstrates in chapter 14, arguing that this engendered a distinct maritime sub-culture that affected the labour services of customary tenants, coastal by-employments, peasant mobility and the standing and influence of maritime women. In chapter